



Saether, Eva and Ballantyn, Julie and Ruthmann, Alex and Dillon, Steven C. and Harrison, Scott (2008) *International perspectives on pedagogies of inclusion in music education : theorising practice*. In: Symposium : International Perspectives on Pedagogies of Inclusion in Music Education : Theorising Practice, Bologna Italy, International Society for Music Education.

© Copyright 2008 [please consult the authors]

**International perspectives on pedagogies of inclusion in music education:**  
**Theorising practice**

EVA SAETHER  
Malmö Academy of  
Music  
[Eva.Saether@mhm.lu.se](mailto:Eva.Saether@mhm.lu.se)

ALEX RUTHMANN  
(USA)  
Indiana State University  
[alex.ruthmann@gmail.com](mailto:alex.ruthmann@gmail.com)

STEVE DILLON  
(AUSTRALIA)  
Queensland University  
of Technology  
[sc.dillon@qut.edu.au](mailto:sc.dillon@qut.edu.au)

JULIE  
BALLANTYNE  
Griffith University  
[Julie.ballantyne@griffith.edu.au](mailto:Julie.ballantyne@griffith.edu.au)

SCOTT HARRISON  
Griffith University  
[Scott.Harrison@griffith.edu.au](mailto:Scott.Harrison@griffith.edu.au)

Symposium Abstract

*Music education needs to move beyond a fragmented and superficial treatment of diversity. We live in a world where issues of achievement, social equality, learner disaffection and teaching strategies are issues which are rightly at the forefront of educational issues. Despite this, music teachers working with disaffected learners in areas where there is risk of social exclusion are confronted with difficulties: most of them have not been professionally trained for the present situation and lack materials, methods and support for reflection.*

*This Symposium builds on the growing interest in this area<sup>1</sup>. A central tenet of the issue is that if researchers are to understand and characterise pedagogies of inclusion in the context of music education, they need to examine the nature and influence of the interactions, relationships and cultures which constitute and sustain such activity. We also need to move thinking forward on what constitutes effective pedagogies of inclusion undertaken in music education of relevance to researchers and practitioners in inclusion in music and across other domains.*

*In this symposium, authors from around the world (including Sweden, Australia, Hong Kong, the UK, the USA and Canada) each offer a distinctive and valuable contribution to this growing field of scholarship, presenting a wide variety of perspectives, experiences and pedagogical approaches relating to inclusive practice in music education. The aim of this roundtable discussion is thus to:*

- i. explore the complex interplay of culture, values and music pedagogy on issues relating to social inclusion, prompting further discussion on what is universal in inclusive music education and what is country-specific or culture-bound;*
  - ii. shed light on distinctive pedagogies in music education that aim to 'include' those students who would by otherwise excluded; and*
  - iii. pose questions relating to ways that individual teachers can learn, borrow or adapt pedagogies developed in accordance with the needs of the students.*
- At the end of this symposium, audience members will be encouraged join the discussion on pedagogies of inclusion, sharing their own experiences and highlighting future areas for research in this growing area.*

---

<sup>1</sup> These presentations offer a further theorised view of papers submitted as a special issue, to the journal *Research Studies in Music Education* in September 2007.

**Length of session: 2 hours**

**Format of the Symposia**

5 minutes	Introduction to the Symposium		
15 minutes	<i>When minorities are the majority. Voices from a teacher/researcher project in a multicultural school in Sweden.</i> EVA SAETHER  (SWEDEN)	15 minutes	<i>Inspiring music teachers to use music in socially just and inclusive ways</i> JULIE BALLANTYNE AND CARMEN MILLS (AUSTRALIA)
15 minutes	<i>Inclusive pedagogy and learner agency: lessons from student composing experiences</i> ALEX RUTHMANN  (USA)	15 minutes	<i>Addressing exclusionary practices in gendered participation in music: pedagogical approaches to enable inclusion.</i> And Conclusion SCOTT HARRISON  (AUSTRALIA)
15 minutes	<i>Pedagogies of inclusion: a case study examining the struggle of three Australian music teachers engaging with inclusive practice in schools and communities music education'.</i> STEVE DILLON  (AUSTRALIA)	40 minutes	<i>General discussion with audience facilitated by Steve Dillon</i>

1. Inclusive research for inclusive practice: Methodological aspects emanating from a teacher/researcher project in a multicultural school in Sweden.

EVA SAETHER (SWEDEN)

[Eva.Saether@mhm.lu.se](mailto:Eva.Saether@mhm.lu.se)

*She – the researcher – came to the segregated school, equipped with video recorder and a theoretical preunderstanding of the problems the music teacher was facing; 99 % immigrants, demands from the national curriculum and high rate of school failure.*

*He – the teacher – worked in the school because he loved the challenge, and had hands on preunderstanding of the situation; he needed to make music lessons meaningful to the students, to find the key to their own motivation.*

*In this symposium the focus is on the mutual exchange between the researcher and the teacher. To the teacher, the entrance of the researcher in the classroom, gave a possibility for reflection and action based on this reflection. To the researcher, the cooperation with the teacher was a prerequisite to get access to the voices that had to be listened to, in order to develop new knowledge. The music teacher was not only an informant, he was a co-traveller or a co-researcher. The differences between the teacher's role and the researcher's role naturally decreased due to the shared work with planning, realisation and analysing of the project. As in other qualitative research this project has strived to give justice to other people's views, and to interpret in a confiding way. Another point of departure has been that "the researched" should also gain something from the research process. Therefore the video and other recording equipment has been used to give feed-back to the students that they have been able to use for self reflection*

*and to find ways to develop responsibility and initiative.*

**Bionotes:** Eva Sæther is a Senior Lecturer in Music and Society at Malmö Academy of Music. She has her musical background in Swedish folk music, which also serves as her point of departure for development of new courses and projects to serve an intercultural music teacher training at the Malmö Academy of Music, Lund University. In 2003 she defended the doctoral thesis *The Oral University. Attitudes to music teaching and learning in the Gambia*. Apart from teaching Music and Society and Research methodology, she is involved in international and nordic networks concerning world music and cultural diversity in music education. Ongoing research project: SIM, Social Inclusion in Music Education.

2. *Inclusive pedagogy and learner agency: lessons from student composing experiences*  
ALEX RUTHMANN (USA)  
[alex.ruthmann@gmail.com](mailto:alex.ruthmann@gmail.com)

*Drawing on observation and interview data collected from an intrinsic case study of learning and teaching in a music technology lab, this paper focuses on the interactions of inclusive pedagogy and learner agency as evidenced in the negotiated lived experiences of a teacher (Mary), a student composer (Ellen), and Ellen's peers with whom she interacted during a musical soundtrack composing project. Tensions embedded in their collective experiences were analyzed for insights that may help other teachers of music composition in schools provide more inclusive and meaningful feedback through valuing and responding to the student's musical agency and compositional intent. These insights illustrate the complex interplay among the nature of teacher feedback, learner agency, and students' compositional intent, with particular attention to implications aimed at helping teachers facilitate and design composing experiences in more inclusive ways. For this symposium the traditional notion of inclusion as narrowly referring to special needs learners will be problematized and extended. During creative musical experiences, the intentions, needs and desires of learners when creating often comes in conflict with the teacher's desire to take advantage of the 'teachable moment.' Strategies for supporting students' creative intentions through the development of inclusive pedagogical strategies will be shared.*

**Bionotes: Alex Ruthmann is** currently assistant professor of music education at Indiana State University in Terre Haute, IN. His areas of interest are in technology-infused music courses, music composition in the schools, computer-supported collaborative music learning, and alternative music classes in the schools. He specializes in secondary general music methods, non-traditional music courses in the schools, composing curriculum and pedagogy, and music education technology. An active researcher and writer, Dr. Ruthmann has authored lesson materials for the Scott Foresman/Silver Burdett *Making Music* general music curriculum series, as well as articles and chapters published in national and international music education journals and publications. He also serves on the advisory board for the *Center for Applied Research in Musical Understanding* and the editorial board for the *International Journal of Music Education - Practice*.

3. *Pedagogies of inclusion: a case study examining the struggle of three Australian music teachers engaging with inclusive practice in schools and communities music education*.

STEVE DILLON (AUSTRALIA)  
[sc.dillon@qut.edu.au](mailto:sc.dillon@qut.edu.au)

*This study highlights the music-teachers' struggle to engage with inclusion as a basis for teacher-student relationship and classroom and community contexts. It analyses the relationship between character, action and experience and provides a comparison across contexts. The study draws upon Martin Buber's philosophical definition of inclusion as a description of the relationship between teacher and student and examines these tenets through a comparative analysis of the characteristics of three 'exemplary' Australian music teachers who teach in 'difficult contexts'. The study focuses on their personal qualities alongside their ability to design culturally inclusive curriculum and productive relationships with students and community. The teachers' enactment of inclusion is examined within a contemporary Australian multi-cultural and Indigenous context against a prior body of research that privileged the student's voice as music maker and seeks to provide recommendations for how students can benefit from music education practice that focuses upon the qualities of music making which are meaningful and inclusive. The theoretical assertions of this paper are that good music teachers struggle with their relationships with students and community and the quality and impact of social or musical outcomes.*

**Bionotes:** Steve Dillon is a senior lecturer in Music and Sound at Queensland University of Technology

Faculty of Creative Industry. Steve's research focuses upon meaningful engagement with music-making in schools and communities. He is director of the *save to DISC* (Documenting Innovation in Sound Communities) <http://www.savetodisc.net/> research project which examines and documents the qualities and relationships between music, meaning, health and well being. Author of *Music, Meaning and Transformation* Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

4. *Addressing exclusionary practices in gendered participation in music: pedagogical approaches to enable inclusion.*

SCOTT HARRISON (AUSTRALIA)

*Music is a form of social and cultural interaction and, as such, creates boundaries that embody exclusion. The focus for the paper is on the way in which gender has been one of the primary principles for exclusion in the Western Art music tradition, based on presumptions about erroneous hegemonic stereotypical images that prevail in social institutions such as schools, tertiary institutions and community music environments. Data are from school students, tertiary students, teachers and community musicians. The paper embraces and elaborates on post-feminist approaches to effective pedagogies of inclusion to ensure both sexes have access to a gender-just musical environment, where disempowerment and disadvantage are replaced with positive contexts in which students are able to realise their full potential. Beyond theory, the presentation provides practical examples of the engagement of both sexes in music in a variety of contexts.*

**Bionotes:** SCOTT HARRISON is Lecturer in Music and Music Education at Griffith University. A graduate of Queensland Conservatorium, Scott has experience in teaching singing and music in primary, secondary and tertiary environments. Performance interests and experience include opera and music theatre as both singer and musical director. Scott's main research interests are in Gender in Music Education, Music and Health, Teacher Education, Choral and Vocal Training. Scott is the current President of the Australian National Association of

Teachers of Singing. Scott is the author of *Masculinities and Music*, Cambridge Scholars Publishing and editor of *Music and Manhood Down Under*, Australian Council for Educational Research.

6. Inspiring music teachers to use music in socially just and inclusive ways

JULIE BALLANTYNE AND  
CARMEN MILLS (AUSTRALIA)

[julie.ballantyne@griffith.edu.au](mailto:julie.ballantyne@griffith.edu.au)

*Teacher education plays a significant role in influencing the approaches of generations of future teachers. It is arguably during teacher education that teachers develop their attitudes and approaches towards teaching students in an inclusive manner. This paper examines the perceptions of six pre-service teachers who are interviewed before graduating, and then again six months into their first year of teaching. These teachers reflect on their understandings of what constitutes inclusive practice in the music classroom and how these have been influenced by their perceptions of both university and school experiences. The interview data is examined in relation to distributive, retributive and recognitive perspectives on social justice evident in their accounts. The perceptions of the teachers interviewed emerge as significantly 'coloured' in the ways they view inclusive practice in the music classroom. The paper concludes with questions regarding the ways that teacher education programs might inspire early-career teachers to use music in socially just and inclusive ways in the classroom, particularly moving towards approaches that are more closely aligned with a recognitive view of social justice.*

**Bionotes:** Julie Ballantyne is a lecturer in music and arts education at Griffith University. Julie has taught classroom music to students at both Primary and Secondary levels. She completed her PhD in music teacher education in 2005 and is on the editorial board of the International Journal of Music Education.. Julie's research includes preservice teacher education, challenges for early-career teachers including praxis shock and burnout, arts education, music education, teacher identity, curriculum evaluation and music learning in informal environments. Julie has published in the areas of identities of early-career music teacher, comparisons between early-career and pre-service music teachers' perceptions of course effectiveness, trends in teacher education, philosophical allegiances of early-career music teachers and subject choice of secondary school students.

Carmen Mills is a Lecturer in the sociology of education. Carmen's research interests include the sociology of education, social justice in education, schooling in disadvantaged communities and teacher education. As a critical researcher, informed by the work of Pierre Bourdieu and others, she is concerned to explore whose interests are served by the social arrangements evident in educational contexts and how these arrangements might be structured more equitably. She has strong interests in issues of social justice in education and schooling in disadvantaged communities. More recently she has begun to explore what teacher education for social justice might look like.

